



**STATE ASSESSORS BOARD  
REGULAR MEETING MINUTES OF DECEMBER 21, 2007  
Bond Finance Board Room, Richard H. Austin Building  
430 West Allegan Street, Lansing, Michigan**

**CALL TO ORDER:** The December 21, 2007 meeting of the State Assessors Board was called to order at 9:30 a.m. in the Bond Finance Board Room in the Richard H. Austin Building, 430 West Allegan Street, Lansing, Michigan.

**ROLL CALL:** Members present: Lisa A. Hobart, Chairperson  
Henry O. Allen, Vice Chairperson (arrived at 9:32 a.m.)  
Maxine J. McClelland, Member  
Raman A. Patel, Member

Member absent: Frederick W. Morgan, Member (excused)

Staff present: David C. Lee, Executive Secretary

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES:** It was moved by McClelland, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to adopt the regular meeting minutes of the November 16, 2007 meeting of the State Assessors Board as presented.

**PUBLIC COMMENT:** There was no public comment.

**EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMS:**

1. It was moved by Patel, seconded by McClelland, and unanimously approved to increase the number of annual certification renewal hours from 6 to 12, effective October 1, 2008.
2. It was moved by Allen, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to deny the level 3 experience qualification request of Mr. Antonio Davis.
3. It was moved by McClelland, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to grant approval to the level 3 experience qualification requests of Ms. Shannon M. Chappell, Mr. Tod G. Fackler, Mr. Andrew W.C. Falkenberg, Ms. Judith A. Harrington, Ms. Joycelyn R. Isenberg, Ms. Laurie K. Kelso, Ms. Jeanne L. Kolenda, Mr. James J. Licari, Ms. Debra L. McKenzie, Ms. Lisa L. Pung, Ms. Christine A. Ritchie, Ms. Linda A. Spearling, Mr. Joseph Toogood, Ms. Teresa Trujillo, Ms. Deborah K. Valentine, Ms. Nermina N. Vidovic, and Ms. Patricia H. Zamenski.
4. Instructor evaluations for State Assessors Board Course 1 were received by the Board.
5. It was moved by McClelland, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to pay an amount not to exceed \$300 for audio-visual charges for the six-hour renewal session to be held by the Board January 8, 2008 at the Michigan Townships Association annual conference.

**CERTIFICATION LEVEL MATTERS:** It was moved by Allen, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to grant the request of Huron County to share a level 3 equalization director with Tuscola County on a trial basis until June of 2009, provided the same equalization director remains in place and with the Executive Secretary to consult periodically with Assessment and Certification Division staff regarding the quality of the equalization process for the Counties.

**CERTIFICATION APPLICANTS:** It was moved by McClelland, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to grant formal approval to the list of certification applicants provided to the Board. The list of certification applicants which was approved by the Board and the certification totals presented to the Board were as follows:

**Certification Applicants  
December 17, 2007**

**Level 2**

Barnett, Joanie  
Fricke, Christine  
Heck, Nancy  
Hiatt, Robyn L.

Jollay, Sharon Rose  
Kruithoff, Bruce A.  
McCallum, Valerie J.  
Miro, Bethl

Nephew, Rachel  
Senters, Lisa  
Totten, Brady J.  
VandenBerg, Laurie L.

**Level 3**

Hayduk, Mellissa K.  
Lidgard, Peggy A.

Osterman, Lora L.  
Rivington, Jessica V.

Smith, Christopher T.

**Certification Totals  
December 17, 2007**

Level 1	587
Level 2	976
Level 3	883
Level 4	<u>148</u>
<b>Total</b>	<b>2,594</b>

**FIRST MEETING RECESS:** The meeting recessed at 9:40 a.m. The meeting reconvened at 9:55 a.m.

**ROLL CALL:** Members present: Lisa A. Hobart, Chairperson  
Henry O. Allen, Vice Chairperson  
Maxine J. McClelland, Member  
Raman A. Patel, Member

Member absent: Frederick W. Morgan, Member (excused)

Staff present: David C. Lee, Executive Secretary

**STATE TAX COMMISSION REFERRAL:** The conduct of an assessing officer in a required reappraisal situation was considered by the Board. At the request of the assessing officer, Mr. David B. Swinson, the matter was held in open session. Mr. Swinson appeared before the Board at the Board's request. Mr. Swinson was accompanied by his legal counsel, Mr. Chuck Hewitt. Ms. Cynthia S. Reetz, District Supervisor, Assessment and Certification Division District 4, also appeared before the Board at the Board's request. Ms. Janice L. Rais, Property Analyst, Assessment and Certification Division District 4, appeared with Ms. Reetz. After receiving documentation and comments from those appearing before the Board, the Board took no further action concerning the matter.

**FIRST CLOSED MEETING:** A closed meeting was permissible under the Open Meetings Act, Michigan Compiled Law (MCL) 15.268(a) and 15.268(h). (See also the Freedom of Information Act, MCL 15.243(1)(b)(ii), 15.243(1)(d), and 15.243(1)(k) and the Open Meetings Act, MCL 15.267(2).) A motion was made by McClelland and seconded by Patel to go into closed session. A roll call vote occurred: Hobart—yes, Allen—yes, McClelland—yes, and Patel—yes. The motion was unanimously approved.

A closed session was held and the following items were discussed by the Board:

1. Closed meeting minutes from November 16, 2007
2. November 2007 course examinations
3. Revocation petitions 06-0030, 06-0031, 06-0034, and 06-0035

A motion was made by Allen and seconded by Patel to return to open session. A roll call vote occurred: Hobart—yes, Allen—yes, McClelland—yes, and Patel—yes. The motion was unanimously approved.

**SECOND MEETING RECESS:** The meeting recessed for lunch at 12:40 p.m. The meeting reconvened at 1:40 p.m.

**ROLL CALL:** Members present: Lisa A. Hobart, Chairperson  
Henry O. Allen, Vice Chairperson  
Maxine J. McClelland, Member  
Raman A. Patel, Member

Member absent: Frederick W. Morgan, Member (excused)

Staff present: David C. Lee, Executive Secretary

**SECOND CLOSED MEETING:** A closed meeting was permissible under the Open Meetings Act, MCL 15.268(h). (See also the Freedom of Information Act, MCL 15.243(1)(b)(ii) and 15.243(1)(k).) A motion was made by Patel and seconded by McClelland to go into closed session. A roll call vote occurred: Hobart—yes, Allen—yes, McClelland—yes, and Patel—yes. The motion was unanimously approved.

**SECOND CLOSED MEETING (Continued):** A closed session was held and the following items were discussed by the Board:

1. Revocation petition 07-0021
2. Revocation petition 07-0010
3. A second request challenging the first grading of narrative appraisal 201

A motion was made by Patel and seconded by Allen to return to open session. A roll call vote occurred: Hobart—yes, Allen—yes, McClelland—yes, and Patel—yes. The motion was unanimously approved.

**OPEN MEETING ACTIONS ON CLOSED MEETING ITEMS:**

1. It was moved by Allen, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to adopt the closed meeting minutes of November 16, 2007 as presented.
2. No action was taken by the Board regarding November 2007 course examination results.
3. It was moved by McClelland, seconded by Allen, and unanimously approved to postpone a decision on revocation petitions 06-0030, 06-0031, 06-0034, and 06-0035 until the January 4, 2008 meeting of the Board.
4. It was moved by Allen, seconded by McClelland, and unanimously approved to hold an informal revocation hearing with regard to revocation petition 07-0021.
5. It was moved by McClelland, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to dismiss revocation petition 07-0010.
6. It was moved by Allen, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to deny the second request challenging the first grading of narrative appraisal 201.

**COMMUNICATIONS:** There were no communications.

**OTHER BUSINESS:**

1. It was moved by Allen, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to use State Assessors Board funds to pay one-third of the cost to produce and mail the 2008 property tax CD.
2. It was moved by McClelland, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to approve the certificate of appreciation for Mr. Vincent S. Kopacko.
3. It was moved by Allen, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to coordinate efforts with the Michigan Tax Tribunal so that the Board becomes aware of instances of an assessing officer failing to appear for an Entire Tribunal matter and of repeated failure by an assessing officer to appear for Small Claims Division matters.

**ANNOUNCEMENTS:** The next meeting of the State Assessors Board is scheduled for January 4, 2008 at 9:30 a.m. in the first floor Bond Finance Board Room of the Richard H. Austin Building, 430 West Allegan Street, in Lansing.

**ADJOURNMENT:** It was moved by Allen, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to adjourn the meeting. The meeting adjourned at 1:50 p.m.

**Date minutes typed:** December 26, 2007

**Date minutes approved:** 1/4/2008

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Lisa A. Hobart, Chairperson